

DRAFT Minutes of the 52nd ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING of the Australian Association for Research in Education

Meeting Date	Wednesday 30 th November 2022
Meeting Location	Hybrid: In person: Room H2-16, University of South Australia, City West Campus Online: via Zoom
Meeting Opened:	5.15pm ACDT
Attendees:	<p>Quorum declared by Secretary John Lester (25 members required) 43 participants present in person 8 participants present in Zoom: Total 51 AARE members attended the meeting, refer to full list on page 8, included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • President, Allyson Holbrook • President Elect Julie McLeod • Treasurer, Michele Simons • Secretary, John Lester • Research Development Coordinator, Anna Sullivan • Guest: Amanda Mehegan, AARE Office, Minutes • Guest: Susie Knight, AARE Office • Guest: Jo Hood, AARE Office
Item 1 Welcome and apologies	<p>Allyson opening the meeting and noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome to members in person and online • Acknowledgment of country • Procedures noted and an overview of the agenda provided • No other business added to agenda
Item 2 Confirmation of minutes	<p>51st Annual General Meeting, 1 December 2021 by Zoom</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minutes taken as read • No comments, questions or amendments <p>Resolution: That the minutes of the 51st Annual General Meeting held virtually on 1 December 2021 be taken as read and accepted as an accurate record. Motion: Moved Stewart Riddle, Second Nicole Mockler. Vote passed.</p>
Item 3 Reports from the Executive	<p>Reports from Executive</p> <p>Allyson Holbrook noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report taken as read. • Annual Report circulated to members 8 November, representing 21-22 financial year as well as a few updates through to Sept/Oct • Issue to note: Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG grievance report from caretaker leaders. Executive met to address grievances to ensure that the Statement of Reconciliation 2018 be upheld, particularly with regard to Executive representation. Executive meeting with SIG on Sunday 27th November with more actions to be forthcoming. • Changes to the Executive Funding Policy; support face to face meetings. • MOU signed with Melbourne University for 2023 Conference.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need for Constitutional change in line with legal advice; members to be consulted, draft constitutional to be produced in 2023, full and final constitution expected to be implemented in 2024. <p>Questions/comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Melitta Hogarth query timing of constitution change <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Response from Chair: Draft 2023, likely to be 2024 for completion of full and final by AGM 2024 but doesn't have to wait that long, could have special general meeting <p>Resolution: That the 2021-2022 Annual Report from the Executive be accepted. Motion: Moved Anna Sullivan, Second Abbey MacDonald. Vote Passed</p>
<p>Item 4 Financial Reports</p>	<p>4.1 Financial statements and Auditor's report for year ended 30 June 2022</p> <p>Report taken as read. Michele Simons noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2021-2022 has seen a significant reversal of the operating conditions of AARE. • Successful online conference in 2021 and membership recovery saw an increase in income compared to the previous financial year. • Audited financial report shows a profit result achieved, and assurance that the association is a significant financial ongoing operation. • 21-22 financial year saw a shift in the way in which the association spends its money, namely the contracting of FineHaus and moving away from employees; expecting to see greater efficiency as we complete this transition. • Executive continue to monitor membership receipts and we have seen a stabilising at around \$75,000 income from membership. • Balance sheet shows a good equity position; currently holding more than 2 years operating funds in reserves providing an opportunity to consider equitable investment in initiatives to service members in the year ahead. <p>Resolution: That the presentation of the audited Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2022, including the auditor's report, be noted. Motion: Moved Ellen Larsen, Second Ilektra Spandagou. Vote Passed.</p> <p>4.2 Appointment of auditor for 2022-2023</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Michele noted that following an assessment of the previous auditor, the Executive is recommending a change of Auditor to McPhail & Partners. <p>Resolution: That McPhail & Partners be appointed as the Association's auditor for the year to 30 June 2023 at remuneration to be agreed with the Executive. Motion: Moved Marie Brennan, Second Abbey MacDonald. Vote Passed.</p>

<p>Item 5 Confirmation of results of 2022 election of members of Executive Committee</p>	<p>On behalf of Secretary John Lester, President Allyson Holbrook advised the following outcomes from the 2022 Executive Committee election:</p> <p>An election ballot took place in October 2022. There were 13 nominations for 5 positions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 nomination for Secretary <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Professor Annette Woods, elected without ballot • 1 nomination for Treasurer <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Professor Michele Simons, elected without ballot • 2 nominations for Research Development Coordinator; 1 withdrawn prior to ballot <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Professor Kalervo Gulson, elected without ballot • 4 nominations for Ordinary Member Post Graduate Student; 1 withdrawn prior to closing of ballot <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Ms Sarah Langman, elected by ballot • 5 nominations for Ordinary Member <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Professor Christopher Boyle, elected by ballot <p>For noting, other vacancies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resignation August 2022 - Prof Gawaian Bodkin-Andrews Convenor of the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG and Executive Portfolio holder as Indigenous Researcher Liaison <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Vacancy to be filled by nomination/election undertaken by the Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG • Resignation October 2022 – Dr Abbey MacDonald Communications Coordinator <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Commencing December 2022 – Dr Amanda Levido Communications Coordinator <p>Welcome to all incoming Executive members and to incoming AER Editor in Chief, Associate Professor Stewart Riddle, appointed by selection panel.</p> <p>Deep and sincere thanks to all outgoing members:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Secretary – Professor John Lester • Research Development Coordinator – Professor Anna Sullivan • Ordinary Member Post Graduate Student – Ms Natalie Downes • Ordinary Member – Dr Sara Weuffen • Communications Coordinator - Dr Abbey MacDonald • Indigenous Researcher Liaison - Prof Gawaian Bodkin-Andrews • AER Editor in Chief – Associate Professor Nicole Mockler <p>Resolution: That the members confirm the results of the 2022 election for available positions on the Executive Committee. Motion: Moved Sara Weuffen, Second Annette Woods. Vote Passed.</p> <p>Resolution: That appreciation be expressed to outgoing members of the Executive for their contributions to the governance of AARE. Motion: Moved Martin Mills, Second Olivia Johnston. Vote Passed.</p>
---	--

<p>Item 6 Voting on submitted motions</p>	<p>Explanation of Motion 1 by Chair:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There has always been the intention of two Indigenous Executive members, nominated and elected by the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG. • Prior to the AGM, SIG leaders drew attention to the fact that there was no real clarity about this in various ways, including in the Constitution. • Allyson worked with John Lester to revise the wording of clause 6.6f so that this would be crystal clear. • In future, appropriate clauses will be inserted into a new Constitution. • Motion 1 is proposed to offer an immediate change that will support both Executive Committee functions and the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG. <p>Discussion for/against:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gawaian Bodkin-Andrews: The Executive positions should be taken up by <u>identified</u> Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander members. Not all members of the SIG are identified as Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander. Request to add the word “identified” to the motion. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Agreed to amend by Chair. • Annette Woods: Request for clarification as to why the second Executive position is one of the co-opted positions rather than a second full named and identified position on the Executive Committee. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Response by Chair. Executive proposed the change to work within the constitution as it stands, knowing that more complete Constitution change is planned in the year ahead, which will work in alignment with an Indigenous Governance framework. This is at best a “fix for now”. The Executive Committee will be guided by the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG in relation to next actions. • Stewart Riddle: Agree, the second position should be its own role because by using up one of the co-opted positions, it closes off the opportunity to co-opt someone else for another purpose as we may hit the limit of co-opted positions. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ The Chair thanked Stewart for his comment. • Martin Mills: Query as to whether the motion wording came from the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG and what their view is of this wording. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Allyson described the process for developing the wording: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The SIG grievances were submitted to the Executive Committee in a timeframe that was very close to the AGM. ▪ An urgent meeting of Executive Committee was convened to review the grievances and consider appropriate responses. ▪ Allyson and John worked very quickly to draft and circulate to the full Executive Committee. ▪ The proposed motion was sent to the identified SIG caretaker leaders as soon as they were drafted, seeking changes/input. • Gawaian comment on SIG process: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Wording was discussed by 4 senior SIG caretaker leaders. It was not circulated to the broader SIG. ☞ A meeting between the SIG and Executive Committee was held to further discuss appropriate actions.
---	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Did not realise that there was an opportunity to revamp the wording or propose a full positions rather than a co-opted position. ☞ There is a stage-like process in place with a working party of 9-10 representatives that has cross over with the two identified positions. • Melitta Hogarth comment: We had a 24 hour turn around to respond to the wording of the motion; was difficult to offer more than basic agreement that we were getting movement in the right direction. • Martin Mills: Uncomfortable voting without knowing what the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG position is. Don't know how to vote. • Melitta Hogarth: Back in 2018, the idea was to have two full positions (rather than one full position, one co-opted), which would retain two co-opted positions. I feel that at least we are getting some movement and putting trust in the Executive and Association that they will stand by what they said at the meeting on Sunday and we are hopeful that the Indigenous Governance body as mentioned by Gawaian will come to fruition and become part of the Constitution so that we are able to share the load. There are not many Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander representatives within the whole of AARE so that puts an incredible amount of work on just two people. • Kevin Lowe: What has been moved guarantees two on the executive, there is also an agreement between the SIG and the Executive that we will go into a process of discussion and negotiation about what the change will turn into over the course of 2023 and wrapped up into the Constitutional change to be presented to be moved at the end of the year. On balance, this allows us to move forward with the comfort that we have two members on the Executive which we didn't have for the best part in 2022. That restores the status quo as it was when I was on the Executive and it allows us to negotiate between the SIG and the Executive as to what it would look like in the future. • Annette: 2024 is too long to wait; support for the notion that if this is a fix that we are moving quickly to having two members listed as members on the Executive and that we can move more quickly than two years time. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Comment from Chair: that was a conservative estimate so duly noted. • Sophie Rudolf: Clarification questions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ Can we debate this motion? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Chair response: Yes ☞ Can we put forward another motion? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Chair response: No, we cannot put forward another motion to change anything in the Constitution. It is possible to have a Special General Meeting but the motions would have to go out ahead of time. • Annette Woods: If we debate and put forward a motion here, does it require a Special General Meeting or can it go out to a vote by members across the next 3 weeks? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☞ A motion can be put to the floor about something else that is not about the Constitution. • Support from Gawaian to hear ideas about amendment to the motion. • Kevin Lowe: My understanding is that usually in this environment, we can vote on Constitutional resolutions that have been provided to members in advance, but the AGM can also vote non constitutional resolutions which
--	---

is what Annette was alluding to, that there would be a resolutions from the meeting if it was so agreed to that the Executive would be given some clear directions as to how quickly things need to proceed over the coming year, and the process. Agree that the notice period is required for Constitutional resolutions.

- Allyson Holbrook: We do have an order of business that we need to vote on the motion put forward and then we can vote on another non constitutional motion.
- Sophie Rudolf: Could we vote to amend this motion?
 - ☞ Response from Chair: It can't be a major amendment as that would require the notice period.
- Sara Weuffen: Wording in the motion should be "Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander" in all cases.
 - ☞ Response from Chair: Accepted.
- Annette Woods: Suggest a small change that Motion 1 is voted "on the basis of" the conditions described in a subsequent motion to hold us to account. Such as "in combination with a motion drawn from the floor."
- Martin Mills: additional wording change to add "research", such that the SIG is referred to as the Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Research SIG, to align with the SIG structure.
- [Chair proposed a motion to extend the meeting time by 15 minutes. Moved Kevin Lowe, Second Nicole Mockler.](#)
- Edited Motion presented to members, edits reviewed and corrected as per wording agreed in discussion.
- Comment from Naomi Barnes: We need to look at the rules of an annual general meeting, Constitution clause 8.5f says any other business requiring consideration by the Association in General Meeting. There is no rule against bringing up new motions within the AGM in the Constitution.
 - ☞ Response from Chair: Other motions are fine as long as they don't require Constitutional change. We have previously sought legal advice and that is the correct interpretation.
- Melitta Hogarth: clarification about the 2nd motion.
 - ☞ Response from Chair: the next motion is about timely action as requested by Annette; a motion that reinforces the energy and timing of the next move.
- Martin Mills: query about wording on screen compared to the wording in the voting portal.
- Voting portal updated to reflect the revised wording.

Revised Motion put to members

[That clause 6.6f of the AARE Constitution be changed as follows:](#)

[The Executive Committee may co-opt the chairpersons of any standing committees for a defined period. The Executive Committee may also co-opt up to two other members. One of these co-opted positions will be filled by an identified Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander person, nominated by the Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG. The other co-opted member will have expertise in relation to particular issues or activities as required. Co-opted members will serve for a defined period and will have all the powers and functions of elected members.](#)

[Moved John Lester, Second Kevin Lowe. Vote Passed.](#)

<p>Item 6 Voting on submitted motions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Motion 2 wording put forward by Annette Woods: • Gawaian comment: We are at risk of conflating two separate issues here. Identifying Indigenous Executive representation is a work in progress to come into play well before the next AGM. I support the wording that was agreed to in the motion 1 but I don't want to wait until 2024 before we have a resolution to formalise the Indigenous Governance Committee as a decision making authority about Indigenous issues within AARE. • Response from Chair: The wording put forward by Annette did state timing by the next AGM in 2023. The suggestion to finalise by 2024 was certainly with the expectation that the work would progress in 2023 and could be finalised sooner. • Gawaian: Support the idea of a deadline, to set this in stone that this is when it will occur; perhaps that's what the motion can offer. • Response from Chair: If there are delays or issues outstanding at the point of the AGM next year, we certainly can agree to a Special General Meeting to resolve matters as swiftly as possible outside of the AGM. The intent is there to fast track this. • Olivia Johnston: Note that the motion refers to two devoted identified Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander Executive positions, separate from someone like John Lester who is the current Secretary but is not taking up one of the devoted Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander positions. • Anna Sullivan: Understanding that we are aiming to build in Constitutional change that will bring about a governance shift for Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander members and that's the commitment that we had on the meeting on Sunday. Not sure this motion is broad enough to cover the commitment for governance change. • Response from Gawaian: The intention now is to restore what should already have been in place, that is two devoted Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander Researcher Executive positions. • Response from Chair: Yes and the 2nd motion is to vote on facts tracking as many changes that fit with the SIG advice. • Melitta Hogarth: please add that we are going to work towards an Indigenous governance body being included in the Constitution, by the 2023 AGM. • Julie McLeod: Motion 1 is a restoration of what should have been but wasn't occurring. Motion 2 is a question of expediting, timeliness and urgency to enact. We also need to investigate the most appropriate, effective and sustainable way to ensure that Indigenous Governance processes improve. I am not sure this requires Constitutional change, we may already have the power to do this; open question. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Response from Gawaian: Some progress on this has already been made; we are exploring currently multiple options. • Response from Chair: This motion is about the appetite to move quickly. • Melitta Hogarth: Thank you on behalf of the SIG.
---	--

	<p>Resolution: That the AARE Executive work with the leadership of the Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG to bring forward the constitutional change required to reinstate two devoted positions on the Executive filled by identified Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander members; and to establish an accountable and sustainable AARE Indigenous Governance model; by the 2023 AGM. <u>Moved Melitta Hogarth, Second Anna Sullivan. Vote Passed.</u></p>
Meeting close	<p>Final Comments from Chair:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Thank you to outgoing Executive for your commitment to AARE, hard work and service to the field of education. • Thank you to conference hosts University of South Australia and especially Anna Sullivan • Thank you to every member of the conference committee, particularly Bev Rogers. • Thank you to the Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG caretaker leaders for your advice. <p>Comments from Julie McLeod: Allyson is not strictly an outgoing member of the Executive as she will stay on in a past president capacity but I do want to thank her in a formal minuted way for her service and leadership over the past couple of years, thank you very much Allyson. Chair closed the meeting at 6.45 pm ACDT</p>
Issued to members following the meeting close	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2023 AARE Conference will be held in Melbourne, hosted by the University of Melbourne Graduate School of Education. • The Association's 53rd Annual General Meeting will be held on Wednesday 29th November at a time and venue to be confirmed, within the conference program.

Member Presiding: Professor Allyson Holbrook

Signed:

AP Holbrook

Summary of resolutions passed in the meeting:

Item 2 Confirmation of Minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resolution: That the minutes of the 51st Annual General Meeting held virtually on 1 December 2021 be taken as read and accepted as an accurate record. Motion: Moved Stewart Riddle, Second Nicole Mockler. Vote passed.
Item 3 Reports from the Executive	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resolution: That the 2021-2022 Annual Report from the Executive be accepted. Motion: Moved Anna Sullivan, Second Abbey MacDonald. Vote Passed
Item 4 Financial Reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resolution: That the presentation of the audited Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2022, including the auditor's report, be noted. Motion: Moved Ellen Larsen, Second Ilektra Spandagou. Vote Passed. Resolution: That the Sinclair Chartered Accountants be appointed as the Association's auditor for the year to 30 June 2022 at remuneration to be agreed with the Executive. Motion: Moved Marie Brennan, Second Abbey MacDonald. Vote Passed.
Item 5 Confirmation of results of 2022 election of members of Executive Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resolution: That the members confirm the results of the 2022 election for available positions on the Executive Committee. Motion: Moved Sara Weuffen, Second Annette Woods. Vote Passed. Resolution: That appreciation be expressed to outgoing members of the Executive for their contributions to the governance of AARE. Motion: Moved Martin Mills, Second Olivia Johnston. Vote Passed.
Item 6 Voting on submitted motions	<p>Motion 1 (revised in the meeting) That clause 6.6f of the AARE Constitution be changed as follows: The Executive Committee may co-opt the chairpersons of any standing committees for a defined period. The Executive Committee may also co-opt up to two other members. One of these co-opted positions will be filled by an identified Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander person, nominated by the Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG. The other co-opted member will have expertise in relation to particular issues or activities as required. Co-opted members will serve for a defined period and will have all the powers and functions of elected members. Moved John Lester, Second Kevin Lowe. Vote Passed.</p>
	<p>Motion 2 (put to members in the meeting) That the AARE Executive work with the leadership of the Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander Research SIG to bring forward the constitutional change required to reinstate two devoted positions on the Executive filled by identified Aboriginal &/or Torres Strait Islander members; and to establish an accountable and sustainable AARE Indigenous Governance model; by the 2023 AGM. Moved Melitta Hogarth, Second Anna Sullivan. Vote Passed. Melitta Hogarth: On behalf of the SIG, can we say thank you.</p>

Meeting Attendees:

1. Abbey MacDonald
2. Allyson Holbrook
3. Amanda Levido
4. Anna Sullivan
5. Annette Woods
6. Dr Bev Rogers
7. Bonita Cabiles
8. Carolyn Maxwell
9. Prof Catherine Manathunga
10. Christopher Boyle
11. David Marc van Reyk
12. Elizabeth Knight
13. Ellen Larsen
14. Fiona Longmuir
15. Gawaiian Bodkin-Andrews
16. Helen Proctor
17. Ian Hardy
18. Ilektra Spandagou
19. Jayne Carruthers
20. Joanna Anderson
21. John Lester
22. Julianne Moss
23. Julie McLeod
24. Kalervo Gulson
25. Kate Caldecott-Davis
26. Kathryn Grushka

27. Kevin Lowe
28. Kim Anh Dang
29. Margaret Cunningham
30. Marie Brennan
31. Martin Mills
32. Melitta Hogarth
33. Michele Simons
34. Naomi Barnes
35. Natalie Downes
36. Nicole Mockler
37. Noel Gough
38. Olivia Johnston
39. Phuong Quyen Vo
40. Qian (Eileen) Yang
41. Robyn Brandenburg
42. Russell Cross
43. Samantha Low-Choy
44. Sara Weuffen
45. Sarah Langman
46. Scott Eacott
47. Sofia Mavropoulou
48. Sophie Rudolph
49. Stewart Riddle
50. Susanna M Conradie
51. Yang Liu

Meeting Guests:

AARE Office - Amanda Mehegan
AARE Office - Susie Knight
AARE Office - Jo Hood