

**DRAFT Minutes of the  
51<sup>st</sup> ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING  
of the Australian Association for Research in Education**

<b>Meeting Date</b>	Wednesday 1 <sup>st</sup> December 2021
<b>Meeting Location</b>	Zoom online meeting space
<b>Meeting Opened:</b>	5.40pm AEDT
<b>Attendees:</b>	<p>Quorum declared by Secretary John Lester (25 members required) 54 participants present in Zoom: 51 AARE members plus 3 guests 58 AARE members attended the meeting, refer to full list on page 8, included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• President, Allyson Holbrook</li> <li>• Immediate Past President Debra Hayes</li> <li>• Treasurer, Michele Simons</li> <li>• Secretary, John Lester</li> <li>• Research Development Coordinator, Anna Sullivan</li> <li>• Guest: Amanda Mehegan, AARE Office, Minutes</li> <li>• Guest: Susie Knight, AARE Office</li> <li>• Guest: Deborah Cracknell, AARE Office</li> </ul>
<b>Item 1 Welcome and apologies</b>	<p>Allyson opening the meeting and noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Welcome to members online</li> <li>• Acknowledgment of country</li> <li>• Housekeeping noted and an overview of the agenda provided</li> </ul>
<b>Item 2 Confirmation of minutes</b>	<p><b>2.1 50th Annual General Meeting, 2 December 2020 by Zoom</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Minutes taken as read</li> <li>• Comment, Marie Brennan – couldn't find 2020 or 2019 annual reports, unable to review</li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the minutes of the 50th Annual General Meeting held virtually on 2 December 2020 be taken as read and accepted as accurate. Motion: Moved Marie Brennan, Second Ilektra Spandagou. Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>2.2 Special General Meeting, 19 May 2021 by Zoom</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Minutes taken as read</li> <li>• Marie Brennan noted some corrections in the discussion section page 3.</li> <li>• Debbie Heck noted that minutes should include a list of who was in attendance. Allyson confirmed that the meeting met attendance requirements, list of attendance can be provided.</li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the minutes of the Special General Meeting held virtually on 19 May 2021 be taken as read and accepted as accurate. Motion: Moved Marie Brennan, Second Amanda Heffernan. Passed</li> </ul>

<p><b>Item 3 Reports from the Executive</b></p>	<p><b>3.1 President's Report</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Allyson Holbrook noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Report taken as read.</li> <li>☞ FY20-21 had been a year of disruption, challenges and changing landscape; echoed during conference.</li> <li>☞ Move from employed office staff to FineHaus Management has commenced well during handover, bidding farewell Deb Cracknell and Lisa Batten.</li> <li>☞ Membership in recovery, in great part due to the successful virtual conference.</li> <li>☞ Reference to the Special General Meeting and motions to be addressed.</li> <li>☞ Agreement to set up a Standing Committee to support the Research Development Portfolio was noted.</li> <li>☞ Farewell to outgoing Executive Committee members: Deb Hayes, Angelique Howell, lisahunter, Stewart Riddle, Amanda Heffernan.</li> <li>☞ Welcome to new members.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the President's report be accepted. Motion: Moved Annette Woods, Second lisahunter. Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>3.2 Treasurer's Report</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Michele Simons noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Report taken as read.</li> <li>☞ Draw attention to feedback from members about banking organisations; intention to transfer reserves to Teachers' Mutual Bank but will need to retain some funds with CBA due to business banking services required for effective operation not offered by Teachers' Mutual Bank.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Gawaian Bodkin-Andrews and Sophie Rudolph asked that the voting process be amended to ensure members can vote FOR, AGAINST, ABSTAIN.</li> <li>• <b>Resolutions:</b> That the Treasurer's report be accepted. Motion: Moved Michele Simons, Second Helen Proctor. Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>3.3 Research Coordinator Report</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Postponed to after financial reports</li> </ul>
<p><b>Item 4 Financial Reports</b></p>	<p><b>4.1 Financial statements for year ended 30 June 2021</b></p> <p><b>4.2 Auditor's report on financial statements for year ended 30 June 2021</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Report taken as read</li> <li>• Michele noted that the financial statements present a picture of the overall health of the association and that the auditor has confirmed a clean bill of health for the association and also noted some opportunities to improve record keeping/reporting to streamline the audit process.</li> <li>• Question: Rosie Baron – sought clarification on the significant decline in concessional membership income from 2020 to 2021, over 60% <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Response from Michele – memberships have reduced across all categories, concessional members may have been more financially impacted by covid changes, also changed to university funding policies. Membership has been a discretionary spend.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Question/comment: Marie Brennan – query about increase in employment costs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Response from Michele – additional support put in place and increase in salary for employees</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the presentation of the audited Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2021, including the auditor’s report, be noted. Motion: Moved Michele Simons, Second John Lester. Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>4.3 Appointment of auditor for 2021-2022</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Michele noted that Sinclair Chartered Accountants had worked with AARE for a number of years, understand AARE and the association business and are diligent in conducting the audit.</li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the Sinclair Chartered Accountants be appointed as the Association’s auditor for the year to 30 June 2022 at remuneration to be agreed with the Executive. Motion: Moved Michele Simons, Second Stewart Riddle. Passed</li> </ul>
<p><b>Item 3 continued: Reports from the Executive</b></p>	<p><b>3.3 Research Coordinator Report</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Anna Sullivan noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Delighted to take on the role and hopeful about the possibilities for the association</li> <li>☞ Position Description for the role, accepted by Executive Committee.</li> <li>☞ Main intention of the role to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ develop a strategy for recognising and promoting excellence in education research</li> <li>▪ advocate for education research in collaboration with other key stakeholders</li> <li>▪ collaborate with research funding organisations for the benefit of members</li> <li>▪ establish a standing committee to oversee this work</li> </ul> </li> <li>☞ Intention to establish various working groups around particular issues, driven by members</li> <li>☞ Working party set up to analyse ARC funding</li> <li>☞ Planning collaborations with AERO, cADRE including a Summit in 2022</li> <li>☞ Working party and MOU with ACEL</li> <li>☞ Looking forward to working with members.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Questions: Lew Zipin – reference to standing committee to oversee the work of this portfolio; it was noted in the SGM that the standing committee would carry on the momentum of the working party and recommendations for proacting research futures, not mentioned in statement of activities. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Response from Anna – confirm that role position does pick up on work from working party and instal a standing committee to carry this forward.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the reports from the Executive be accepted. Motion: Moved John Lester, Second Michele Simons. Passed</li> </ul>

<p><b>Item 5</b> <b>Confirmation of results of 2021 election of members of Executive Committee</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• John Lester advised the following outcomes from the 2021 Executive Committee election: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Professor Julie McLeod nominated unopposed, elected to the role of President Elect</li> <li>☞ Olivia Johnston nominated unopposed, elected to the role of Ordinary Member</li> <li>☞ Poll between Ellen Larson and Kate Smithers, Ellen Larsen elected to the role of Ordinary Member, Early Career Researcher</li> <li>☞ Yet to appoint the Chair of the Conferences Standing Committee</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Resolution:</b> That the members confirm the results of the 2021 election for available positions on the Executive Committee. Motion: Moved John Lester, Second Angelique Howell. Passed</li> </ul>
<p><b>Item 6</b> <b>Voting on submitted motions</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Allyson described the process for dealing with motions as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Allyson to introduce the motion</li> <li>☞ A representative for the motion invited to speak</li> <li>☞ A representative to talk to the opposing case</li> <li>☞ Members invited to comment for/against</li> <li>☞ Results will be shared at the end of voting for all motions</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Comment from Lew Zipin – Lew noted that he was inclined to withdraw Motion 3, provided he had an opportunity to speak to why it was presented, would need 5 minutes and opportunity for others to speak. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Response from Allyson and John Lester – approval to withdraw, agreement to allow Lew to speak to the motion.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Allyson noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Motion 3 required that the association seek legal advice regarding constitutional questions/interpretations.</li> <li>☞ Motion 3 very complex and multi-faceted with implications for the constitution.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>6.1 Motion 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the final report of the AARE Working Party <i>Protecting and Extending Research in Education</i> in Australia be accepted.</li> <li>• Comments for the motion from Marie Brennan – motion was put to allow the final report reflecting identified member needs and issues, to be circulated to the full membership. Working party was established arising from a previous AGM motion at the end of 2017. The working party recommends that surveys of member needs continue in some form in future. Most members were extremely positive about the work of AARE (portfolio, workshops, conference, journal, blog etc). One key issue is the lack of places/opportunities to talk safely – AARE offers this as it is independent of government and university management/sanctions. Many members have emphasised the urgency of the issues presented and how they have been exacerbated during covid. Consideration of how AARE reimagine its services to help counter the crisis of democracy and governance within institutions, acknowledging the volunteer nature of the labour from members.</li> <li>• No comments against Motion: Moved Marie Brennan, Second lisahunter. Passed</li> <li>• Point of order requested by Sophie Rudolf to take a vote to extend the meeting.</li> <li>• Allyson proposed a 20-30 min extension</li> <li>• No comments in opposition</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Resolution</b> Moved Allyson Holbrook, Second Rosie Baron. Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>6.2 Motion 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• As stated in attachment: Motions for AARE AGM 2021</li> <li>• Comments from Marie Brennan – the Working Party proposed a motion at the Special General Meeting in May that the Working Party continue as a Standing Committee. Underpinned by the urgency of identified issues. Standing Committees are an important way to share the workload. Emphasis is advocacy and informed membership. Not trying to restrict the work of the Standing Committee but emphasising priorities and a way to mobilise members and share work. Constitution supports the capacity for the Executive Committee to co-opt additional Standing Committees.</li> <li>• Comments by Lew Zipin – motions have been made since 2017 to ask for a focus of work by AARE, e.g. for AARE to speak about the harms of university restructures. Some of these commitments have not been fulfilled. Time for action and need for more than one portfolio; requires specific involvement from Working Party.</li> <li>• Comments from Anna Sullivan – wish to speak against the motion, not the ideas in the motion. Ideas are important and are being picked up by the portfolio; executive has acknowledged this. Speaking against the motion because as a motion a vote in favour represents a legal commitment to fulfill all points of the motion as they are written, which goes against the strategic intent of the portfolio activity and contribution. The prescriptive nature of the motion is problematic for the association and leaves AARE open to legal ramifications.</li> <li>• Comments from Debra Hayes – support Anna’s view. This is a motion about what the new standing committee should do but it contains a lot of suggestions that almost give the standing committee more power than the executive committee. Any standing committee sits underneath, is created by and is intended to support the work of the executive committee. The motion contains too many parts, some of which could and should be addressed through a refreshed constitution.</li> <li>• Comments from Julie McLeod – not totally against the motion but wish to clarify. The motion seems to specify the terms of reference (TOR) for the standing committee when in fact one of the roles of the standing committee might be to establish its own TOR in conjunction with the Executive Committee. In doing so, it limits its scope and doesn’t leave itself open to changing circumstances. I’m in favour of the recommendation to establish a standing committee but presenting a motion in this way is not the most effective way to establish TOR. If the motion remains as is I would vote against it.</li> <li>• Comments by Lew Zipin – if the working party is dissolved due to the promise of a standing committee, this leads to discontent among members and stalls momentum.</li> <li>• Question to Julie from Sophie Rudolph – how would you amend the motion to allow a vote for       <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Response from Julie – remove the sub clauses, restrictions and directions. Pare down to the establishment of the standing committee</li> <li>☞ Response from Allyson – constitution doesn’t allow significant changes to the motion in the meeting</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Proposed amendment from Craig Wood</li> </ul>
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Move that roman numeral 1, 2, 3 and 5 be struck from the motion so that the new motion reads: That the new Standing Committee on Research Advocacy be established and that it gives initial advocacy focus to the proactive strategies nominated in Recommendation 1 of the 2020 Working Party report, as endorsed at the AARE Special General Meeting of May 2021 and that – new text – its TOR will be proposed to the Executive Committee no later than end March 2022.</li> <li>☞ Allyson and John – unable to change the motion to significant extent, motions require notice to be given to members and must stand or fail on wording offered</li> <li>☞ Craig Wood – motion amendment withdrawn</li> <li>• Comment from Anna Sullivan – I'm not sure why this is an issue. The Executive Committee is setting up a Standing Committee, the Standing Committee will oversee this work. Intention to progress the work expressed in these points have been picked up and agreed by the Executive Committee. Concern I have is that a binding motion is problematic for the association.</li> <li>• Response from Marie Brennan – nothing controversial, not asking that these be the total TOR, many are general and should already be in there, nothing binding. Executive of course sets priorities and the Standing Committee reports to Executive. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ Clarification by Allyson – motion passed does become a resolution.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Resolution</b> As stated in attachment: Motions for AARE AGM 2021 Moved Marie Brennan, Second Craig Wood. Not Passed</li> </ul> <p><b>6.3 Motion 3</b> As stated in attachment: Motions for AARE AGM 2021</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Withdrawn by Lew Zipin</li> <li>• Comments from Lew Zipin (paraphrased) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ I have been involved with many associations, none of which have exerted such prevention of motions from the floor. I ask other members to consider the same.</li> <li>☞ There is a history to the concerns that this motion considers. 21 day notice period had not been enforced in such a way previously. This necessitated the Special General Meeting, subsequently held in May 2021. A request for consideration of terms of reference proposed in the SGM was rejected by the Executive Committee.</li> <li>☞ Recognition that free speech of members is essential to a democratic process and has been agreed by individual Executive Committee members.</li> <li>☞ Propose that the Executive Committee itself is not democratic</li> <li>☞ Dubious legal claims in advice provided; don't wish for more AARE member funds to go to legal advice.</li> <li>☞ Constitutionism and protectionism against legal risk seems to have suddenly emerged, which obscures the democratic process that would allow members to generate constitutional terms.</li> <li>☞ A Constitution needs to give direction to the executive. If this can't occur, there should be democratic change to the Constitution.</li> <li>☞ Both top down and ground up input is vital.</li> <li>☞ Protectionism is killing democracy in the name of preserving it.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☞ I ask the Executive to take seriously the need for member contribution to the association governance through more than just one AMG each year.</li> <li>☞ Motion is withdrawn but request for continued member discussion/participation in new ways</li> <li>• Comments from John Lester – acknowledge the withdrawal and opportunities to bolster democracy within the association. 21 days notice (Westminster System) is essential to allow members to vote on important matters.</li> <li>• Comments from lisahunter – support Lew and the intent of the working party. Important that AARE looks for ways to gather member voice – such as constitution change.</li> <li>• Comments from Julie McLeod – echo John and lisahunter. Important to look for opportunities for members to meet and contribute during the year not just at AGM. AARE has important member convening power.</li> <li>• Comments from Marie Brennan – request that Lew’s notes are sent to Executive.</li> <li>• Comments from Deb Hayes – welcome the opportunity for a longer discussion. Key point is that just because elements of the Constitution have not been previously enacted, does not mean it is null/void. 21 day rule for an AGM is in no way intended to weaken democratic process but rather to strengthen it. It prevents the largest/loudest voices (i.e. mob rule) present at an AGM from setting the association agenda in binding ways. We need safe places to talk. This environment has been unsafe in some places where accusations are made but can’t be defended in the timeframe or format of an AGM.</li> <li>• Comments from Michele Simons – echo what Debra has said. Always open to feedback from members. Sometime intentions to give feedback can create unsafe place. Executive members are elected and work very hard in the best interest of members. A lot to celebrate and be proud of.</li> <li>• Comments from Lew Zipin – agree with various points, very sticky issues, object to the term of mob rule. Need avenues for more time to discuss issues – more time, more meetings for discussion. Opportunities for Special General Meetings where required.</li> </ul>
<b>Item 7 Date and venue of next meeting</b>	Confirmed by Allyson as follows: Wednesday 30 November 2022 Time and Venue to be confirmed.
<b>Meeting closed</b>	Allyson thanks members for their attendance and contribution 7.20 pm AEDT

**Summary of resolutions passed in the meeting:**

Minutes (Agenda item 2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the minutes of the 50th Annual General Meeting held virtually on 2 December 2020 be taken as read and accepted as an accurate record.</li> <li>• That the minutes of the Special General Meeting held virtually on 19 May 2021 be taken as read and accepted as an accurate record.</li> </ul>
Reports (Agenda item 3)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the reports from the Executive be accepted.</li> </ul>
Financial Statements (Agenda item 4.1 and 4.2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the presentation of the audited Financial Statements, including the Auditor's report, for the year ended 30 June 2021 be noted.</li> </ul>
Appointment of Auditor (Agenda item 4.3)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the Sinclairs Chartered Accountants be appointed as the Association's auditor for the year to 30 June 2022 at remuneration to be agreed with the Executive.</li> </ul>
Results of 2021 election of members of Executive (Agenda item 5)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the meeting confirm the results of the 2021 election for available positions on the Executive.</li> </ul>
Voting on submitted motions (Agenda item 6).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Motions as stated in attachment: Motions for AARE AGM 2021</li> <li>• Motion 1 passed</li> <li>• Motion 2 did not pass</li> <li>• Motion 3 withdrawn</li> </ul>

**Meeting Attendees:**

AARE Office_Amanda Mehegan
AARE Office_Deborah Cracknell
AARE Office_Susie Knight
1. Allyson Holbrook
2. Amanda Heffernan
3. Angelique Howell
4. Anna Sullivan
5. Annette Woods
6. Bev Rogers
7. Carol Carter
8. Catherine Manathunga (she/her)# Kabi Kabi Country
9. Craig Wood - Research Officer# QTU
10. Debbie Heck
11. Debra Cunningham
12. Debra Hayes
13. Elke Stracke
14. Ellen Larsen
15. Gawaian Bodkin-Andrews
16. Genevieve Firmer
17. Gregory Martin
18. Hedy Fairbairn
19. Helen Proctor



20. Helen Watt
21. Ilektra Spandagou
22. Jayne Carruthers
23. Jennifer Archer
24. Jo-Anne Reid
25. John Cripps Clark
26. Johnny Lester
27. Julianne Moss
28. Julie McLeod
29. Kate Smithers (Awabakal country)
30. <a href="mailto:Kate.OConnor@latrobe.edu.au">Kate.OConnor@latrobe.edu.au</a>
31. Kathryn Grushka
32. Katrina MacDonald
33. Kim Anh Dang
34. Lew Zipin
35. Li Wang
36. Lisa Batten
37. lisahunter (they/it) Boonwurrung/Bunurong Country (. lisahunter)
38. Lizzie Knight
39. Lynne# Kaurna Yerta
40. Ma. Cecilia Adefuin
41. Margaret Cunningham
42. Marie Brennan
43. Mark Selkrig (he/him)
44. Melitta Hogarth
45. Michele Simons
46. Natalie Downes
47. Nicole Mockler
48. Olivia johnston
49. Peter Twining
50. Rachel Burke
51. Robert Parkes
52. Rosie Barron (she/her) (Rosie Barron)
53. Sara Weuffen
54. Shumaila Kiyani
55. Sophie Rudolph
56. Stewart Riddle
57. Troy Heffernan
58. Yau# Kit Ying Chloe - yauky013